

1 Nathan A. Oyster (SBN 225307)
E-mail: noyster@bwsllaw.com
2 Christopher T. Kim (SBN 279214)
E-mail: ckim@bwsllaw.com
3 BURKE, WILLIAMS & SORESENSEN, LLP
4 444 South Flower Street, Suite 2400
Los Angeles, CA 90071-2953
Tel: 213.236.0600
5 Fax: 213.236.2700

6 Attorneys for Defendants
7 City of Alhambra, David Munson, Bill Rongavilla,
Grant Spencer, and Ruben Soriano

8
9 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
10 **CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

11 JOHN LARE,

12 Plaintiff,

13 v.

14 CITY OF ALHAMBRA; DAVID
15 MUNSON; RUSSELL RONGAVILLA;
16 GRANT SPENCER; RUBEN
SORIANO; and DOES 1-10, inclusive,

17 Defendants.

Case No. 2:15-cv-01321-CAS (GJSx)

DISCOVERY MATTER

PROTECTIVE ORDER

Hon. Gail J. Standish

18
19 **1. INTRODUCTION**

20 **A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS**

21 Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential,
22 proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public
23 disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may
24 be warranted. Accordingly, the Parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to
25 enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The Parties acknowledge that this
26 Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to
27 discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends
28 only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment

1 under the applicable legal principles. The Parties further acknowledge, as set forth
 2 in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to
 3 file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the
 4 procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a
 5 Party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

6 **B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT**

7 This action is likely to involve the production of peace officer personnel
 8 materials, including but not limited to citizen complaints and internal affairs
 9 investigation materials for which special protection from public disclosure and from
 10 use for any purpose other than prosecution of this action is warranted. Such
 11 confidential and proprietary materials and information consist of, among other
 12 things, information otherwise generally unavailable to the public, or which may be
 13 privileged or otherwise protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes,
 14 court rules, case decisions, or common law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of
 15 information, to facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of
 16 discovery materials, to adequately protect information the parties are entitled to
 17 keep confidential, to ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses
 18 of such material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their
 19 handling at the end of the litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order
 20 for such information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that
 21 information will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that
 22 nothing be so designated without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a
 23 confidential, non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part
 24 of the public record of this case.

25 **2. DEFINITIONS**

26 **2.1 Action:** the above-captioned lawsuit of *John Lare v. City of Alhambra*,
 27 *et al.*, USDC Case No. 2:15-cv-01321-CAS-RZ.

28 **2.2 Challenging Party:** a Party or Non-Party that challenges the

1 designation of information or items under this Order.

2 **2.3** “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of
3 how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for
4 protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in
5 the Good Cause Statement.

6 **2.4** Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as
7 their support staff).

8 **2.5** Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or
9 items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as
10 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

11 **2.6** Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless
12 of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including,
13 among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced
14 or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

15 **2.7** Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter
16 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as
17 an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

18 **2.8** House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action.
19 House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside
20 counsel.

21 **2.9** Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or
22 other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

23 **2.10** Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a
24 party to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and
25 have appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm
26 which has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

27 **2.11** Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,
28 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their

1 support staffs).

2 **2.12 Producing Party:** a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
3 Discovery Material in this Action.

4 **2.13 Professional Vendors:** persons or entities that provide litigation
5 support services (*e.g.*, photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or
6 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)
7 and their employees and subcontractors.

8 **2.14 Protected Material:** any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
9 designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

10 **2.15 Receiving Party:** a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery
11 Material from a Producing Party.

12 **3. SCOPE**

13 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only
14 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or
15 extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or
16 compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or
17 presentations by Parties or their Counsel that reveal Protected Material.

18 Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the
19 trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

20 **4. DURATION**

21 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations
22 imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees
23 otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be
24 deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this Action,
25 with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and
26 exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this Action,
27 including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time
28 pursuant to applicable law.

5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.

Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (*e.g.*, to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this Order (*see, e.g.*, second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

(a) for information in documentary form (*e.g.*, paper or electronic documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" (hereinafter "CONFIDENTIAL legend"), to each page that contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page

1 qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected
2 portion(s) (*e.g.*, by making appropriate markings in the margins).

3 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection
4 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated
5 which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and
6 before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be
7 deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting Party has identified the
8 documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine
9 which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order.
10 Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the
11 “CONFIDENTIAL” legend to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a
12 portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing
13 Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (*e.g.*, by making
14 appropriate markings in the margins).

15 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party
16 identify the Disclosure or Discovery Material of all protected testimony on the
17 record, before the close of the deposition.

18 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary
19 and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place
20 on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the
21 legend “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information
22 warrants protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the
23 protected portion(s).

24 **5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate.** If timely corrected, an inadvertent
25 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive
26 the Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such
27 material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make
28 reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the

provisions of this Order.

6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court's Scheduling Order.

6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution process under Local Rule 37-1 *et seq.*

6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (*e.g.*, to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the Court rules on the challenge.

7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

7.2 Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a

1 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated

2 “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

3 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this Action,
4 as well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably
5 necessary to disclose the information for this Action;

6 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House
7 Counsel) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this
8 Action;

9 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to
10 whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the
11 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

12 (d) the court and its personnel;

13 (e) court reporters and their staff;

14 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and
15 Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action
16 and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit
17 A);

18 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information
19 or a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

20 (h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses,
21 in the Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the
22 deposing party requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit A hereto;
23 and (2) they will not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they
24 sign the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless
25 otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of
26 transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected
27 Material may be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to
28 anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

(i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel, mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

**8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED
PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION**

If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

(a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

(b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

(c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

**9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE
PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION**

(a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in this Action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such

1 information produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected
 2 by the remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions
 3 should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

4 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery
 5 request, to produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the
 6 Party is subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's
 7 confidential information, then the Party shall:

- 8 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the
 9 Non-Party that some or all of the information requested is
 10 subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;
- 11 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the
 12 Stipulated Protective Order in this Action, the relevant
 13 discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description
 14 of the information requested; and
- 15 (3) make the information requested available for inspection
 16 by the Non-Party, if requested.

17 (c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court
 18 within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the
 19 Receiving Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive
 20 to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the
 21 Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that
 22 is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a
 23 determination by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party
 24 shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected
 25 Material.

26 **10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

27 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed
 28 Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this

1 Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in
 2 writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best
 3 efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the
 4 person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of
 5 this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the “Acknowledgment
 6 and Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

7 **11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE**
 8 **PROTECTED MATERIAL**

9 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain
 10 inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other
 11 protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal
 12 Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify
 13 whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for
 14 production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence
 15 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure
 16 of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work
 17 product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated
 18 protective order submitted to the court.

19 **12. MISCELLANEOUS**

20 **12.1 Right to Further Relief.** Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any
 21 person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

22 **12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections.** By stipulating to the entry of this
 23 Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to
 24 disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in
 25 this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on
 26 any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective
 27 Order.

28 **12.3 Filing Protected Material.** A Party that seeks to file under seal any

Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at issue. However, only the portions of documents, including briefs, exhibits, or any other moving or opposing papers that contain Protected Material need to be filed under seal. If a Party's request to file Protected Material under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

13. FINAL DISPOSITION

After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

14. PUNISHMENT FOR VIOLATION OF THIS ORDER

Any violation of this Order may be punished by any and all appropriate

1 measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary
2 sanctions.

3 **FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.**

4
5 Dated: September 29, 2015



6
7 Hon. Gail J. Standish
United States Magistrate Judge
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

EXHIBIT A**ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND**

I, _____ [print or type full name], of
 _____ [print or type full address], declare under
 penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated
 Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for the Central
 District of California on _____ [date] in the case of *John Lare v. City of*
Alhambra, et al., United States District Court-Central District Case No. 2:15-cv-
 01321-CAS-RZ . I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this
 Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so
 comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I
 solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item
 that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in
 strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court
 for the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this
 Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after
 termination of this action. I hereby appoint _____ [print or
 type full name] of _____ [print or type full address and
 telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with
 this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective
 Order.

Date: _____

City and State where sworn and signed: _____

Printed name: _____

Signature: _____